

MINUTES
Regular Meeting of the
Edina Heritage Preservation Board
Edina City Hall – Council Chambers
Tuesday, March 10, 2015
7:00 p.m.

I. CALL TO ORDER 7:00 P.M.

II. ROLL CALL

Answering roll call was Chair Weber and Members, Moore, McLellan, Sussman, Christiaansen, Birdman, Pearson and Student Member Otness. Absent were Members O'Brien, Kelly, and Student Member Druckman. Staff present was Senior Planner, Joyce Repya.

III. APPROVAL OF MEETING AGENDA

Member Birdman moved to approve the meeting agenda. Member Moore seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES February 10, 2015

Member Moore moved approval of the minutes from the February 10th meeting. Member McLellan seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

V. COMMUNITY COMMENT - None

VI. REPORTS & RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Certificates of Appropriateness

I. H-15-5 4602 Wooddale Avenue - A new detached garage

Planner Repya explained that the subject property is located on the west side of the 4600 block of Wooddale Avenue. The existing home, a Norman Revival style constructed in 1937, currently has a 2-car detached garage located in the northwest corner of the rear yard.

The COA request entails replacing the existing 528 square foot garage, built in 1973 with a new 470 square foot structure to remedy the substandard condition of the existing garage and allow for an expansion on the rear of the home.

The proposed 2-car detached garage measures 23' x 20' 5 1/4" feet in area. Access to the garage will be obtained on the east elevation from the existing driveway where two overhead doors with divided light windows above are proposed. A service door and windows are provided on the south elevation. The west/rear and north/side elevations lack architectural detailing because both sides abut a tall privacy fence.

Ms. Repya pointed out that the design of the structure is proposed to complement the Norman Revival style of the home. Although the home is clad in brick, the product is no longer available, thus the proposed wood pilasters, parged concrete base and smooth wood cement board will match materials on the sunroom located on the rear of the home. Although the

home has a slate roof, asphalt shingles in a color to complement the home's roof are proposed. The garage plans demonstrate height and massing that are consistent with the surrounding detached garages and new garages previously approved by the HPB through the COA process. Also, the proposed location of the garage is shown to be in compliance with the city's setback requirements.

Ms. Repya added that preservation consultant Robert Vogel had evaluated the plans for the new detached garage and provided his comments pointing out that the proposal is consistent with the design review guidelines presented in the district plan of treatment. He also pointed out that the new garage will match the character of the historic house and be compatible with it in size, scale, massing, and material. It appears to be compatible with the character of the neighborhood and should not detract from the historic significance and integrity of the district as a whole.

Ms. Repya concluded that staff agrees with Consultant Vogel's evaluation, noting that the detached garage is consistent with new garages previously reviewed in the district - thus, she recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

Findings supporting the recommendation include:

- The plans provided with subject request clearly illustrate the scale and scope of the proposed project.
- The new garage will match the character of the historic house and be compatible with it in size, scale, massing, and material.
- The new garage will not be detrimental to the adjacent historic structures.
- The information provided supporting the subject Certificate of Appropriateness meets the requirements of the Country Club District Plan of Treatment.

Conditions for approval:

- Subject to the plans presented and placement of a year built plaque on the exterior of the new detached garage.

Applicant Representative: None in attendance

Board Member Questions/ Comments:

Student Member Otness stated that he liked the proposed plan and believed that they did a good job of complementing the home.

Member Sussman observed that the applicant indicated in their narrative that because the brick on the home is no longer available they opted to clad the proposed garage in a wood panel product, matching an addition on the rear of the home. He pointed out that, they wouldn't necessarily have to match the brick, but could have used a similar brick that complemented the home. That being said, Mr. Sussman stated that the plan was nicely done.

Member Christiaansen stated that she liked the plan, especially how they incorporated aesthetics from the home into the design.

Public Comment: None

Motion:

Member Birdman moved approval of the **Certification of Appropriateness for the new detached garage subject to the plans presented and a year built plaque be installed on the exterior of the garage. Member Moore** seconded the motion. **All voted aye. The motion carried.**

2. H-15-6 Country Club District Neighborhood - New area identification signs at 7 entrances

Planner Repya explained that a committee entitled “Country Club Neighbors for Historic Preservation”, comprised of Country Club District residents is proposing to install area identification signs reading “Country Club District/National Register of Historic Places” at the seven main entrances to the neighborhood.

The proposed signs will be one-sided, facing the respective entrances, measuring not more than 18” x 24” for a total of 3 square feet each. They propose the signs to be mounted to the street light poles at each of the seven entrances. If approved, Edina’s public works department has agreed to mount the signs on the light poles at no cost to the neighborhood.

Because Edina’s sign ordinance allows not more than one area identification sign per neighborhood, not to exceed 6 square feet in area and 6 feet in height, a variance from the sign ordinance will be required since the sign plan exceeds that which is allowed by the code. However, prior to pursuing the variance request, the Planning Commission asks that the HPB first provide approval of the plan through the COA process.

Ms. Repya added that preservation consultant Robert Vogel had evaluated the subject request and observed that the district’s plan of treatment does not address signage, and there is no evidence that entrance signage was included in Samuel Thorpe’s original design of the district during its period of historical significance (1924-1944). However, the Secretary of the Interior’s standards for rehabilitation are applicable in this case.

Mr. Vogel pointed out that the proposed sign plan appears to be appropriate for a historic residential district and should be compatible with the character of the district. Furthermore, the distinguishing original qualities of the historic neighborhood will not be impaired by the signs. Ms. Repya also explained that relative to the standards for rehabilitation, installation of the signs will not destroy or obscure any significant historic architectural or landscape features - the design does not seek to create an earlier appearance; and furthermore they will have

informational value that will help promote heritage stewardship. She added that Mr. Vogel recommended the HPB approve the Certificate of Appropriateness request, and also express support for the required variance request from the Planning Commission.

Planner Repya concluded that Staff too recommends approval of the COA, as well as providing support for the sign variance request required from the Planning Commission.

Findings supporting the approval recommendation include:

- The proposed signs are appropriate for a historic residential district and should be compatible with the character of the district.
- Installation of the signs will not destroy or obscure any significant historic architectural or landscape features
- The signs will have informational value that will help promote heritage stewardship.

Condition for approval:

The final design of the signs is provided to the HPB prior to installation.

Applicant Representative: Jane Lonnquist, 4510 Drexel Avenue, Chairman of the Country Club Neighbors for Historic Preservation

Ms. Lonnquist thanked Ms. Repya for her thorough explanation of the COA request. She went on to explain that the “Country Club Neighbors for Preservation” is a committee of 15 Country Club residents formed to support the Heritage Preservation Board’s mission of preserving the historic integrity of their neighborhood. The committee agreed that providing education to the public would go a long way to raising awareness about the district’s historic significance; and to that end, a first annual historic architectural tour has been planned. The committee also believed that signage calling attention to the historic significance of the district for potential home buyers, real estate agents and the general public would assist the City in enforcing the plan of treatment.

Ms. Lonnquist showed the board a prototype sign designed by the City’s public works department for the neighborhood committee’s consideration. The sign, measuring approximately 18” x 24”, made of aluminum was brown on both sides, with text on one side reading “Historic Country Club District” on the top with a line and CCD logo in the center, and “National Register of Historic Places” on the bottom (all in the same text and size font). Ms. Lonnquist remarked that the committee appreciated the proposal provided by the City at a reasonable cost; however a majority of the members believed the proposed sign was not historic enough, and thus they are currently exploring sign designs from other vendors. Ms. Lonnquist also showed the board some examples of neighborhood signs from around the country with varying sizes, colors and shapes that have spurred interest with the committee.

In closing, Ms. Lonnquist shared with the board that the first annual Historic Neighborhood Walking Tour will occur on Saturday, May 9th, (rain or shine) from 10 - 11 a.m., meeting in Wooddale Park for check-in starting at 9:30 a.m. Registration is required on line at

ccnfp@outlook.com prior to May 1st and a \$5 ticket fee will be payable at the event. She encouraged the HPB to attend the tour, and thanked them for all their efforts toward protecting the historic integrity of the district.

Board Member Questions/Comments:

Member Birdman explained that liked the idea of providing identification signage at the entrances to the district. He observed that the brown color provided on the prototype sign is typical of signage used for historic districts throughout the country, and appears official - conveying a formalized, designated place. Mr. Birdman added that of the sample signs provided, the Lexington Historic District sign - smaller than the proposed signs with a rounded top would be his preference.

Student Member Otness stated that he liked the shape of the sign proposed by the City's public works department.

Member Christiaansen observed that she believed the aesthetics of the sign proposed by the public works department does not lend itself to being hung by brackets from the street light pole; rather would be better suited on a post. She added that since the CCD medallion logo affixed to all the street signs in the district is circular; replicating that shape in the design of the signs might be worth considering.

Member Sussman observed that the size of the signs proposed is perhaps twice as large as the neighborhood signs used in the City of St. Louis Park; and since Edina now has a neighborhood identification program, the signage approved for the Country Club District could set an example for other neighborhoods in the city. Addressing the prototype sign, Mr. Sussman added that he believed the text for "Country Club District" should not be the same size as the text for "National Register of Historic Places". Mr. Sussman concluded that he would like the HPB to have the ability to approve the final sign design.

Public Comment: None

Motion:

Member Birdman moved approval of the Certification of Appropriateness application to allow 7 area identification signs at the main entrances to the Country Club District subject to the HPB having final approval of the design of the signs prior to installation. Member Sussman seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

B. Vision Edina

Assistant City Manager, Karen Kurt provided the board with an overview of the draft Strategic Vision and Framework Report, explaining that the initiative worked with local residents, organizations and businesses to explore:

- What is unique and important about living in Edina?

- Where is there opportunity or need to evolve or change?
- How can we continue to progress to keep the city relevant and attractive to current and future residents and businesses? What is our competitive edge?

She pointed out that the final approved Vision Edina document will serve as an important foundation for other strategic efforts, such as the City's Comprehensive Plan and Capital Improvement Plan.

Ms. Kurt concluded her presentation by explaining that the goal is to approve the draft Strategic Vision and Framework Report during the month of May. She also encouraged the HPB to submit feedback individually or as a group; and to attend an open house that will be held on April 14th from 5:00 - 7:00 p.m. The board thanked Ms. Kurt for updating them on the current status of the Vision Edina project.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Introduction of New Members

Planner Repya explained that the newly appointed members of the HPB are Colleen Pearson and Karen Kelly, as well as former member Michael Birdman who was reappointed. Ms. Kelly was not in attendance; however Ms. Repya did introduce Ms. Pearson. After the board members shared a little about themselves, they welcomed Ms. Pearson (and Mr. Birdman who needed no introduction) - agreeing that they looked forward to working together.

B. 2015 Heritage Award Nominations - Deadline April 8, 2015

Planner Repya reminded the board that the deadline for 2015 Heritage Award nominations is Wednesday, April 8th. Since the February meeting, she received an email from former HPB member Joel Stegner who recommended the board consider designating Savory's Gardens (location of the 2014 summer tour) for the award - noting that he attended the tour and was so impressed with the history of the nursery and the beauty of the property. The board agreed that Savory's Gardens is a hidden treasure in the city, and would be a worthy nomination.

Member Birdman observed that after the first of each year the HPB appears to scramble in an effort to encourage nominations for the annual award, thus he suggested that a line item for potential heritage award nominations be included on the monthly HPB meeting agendas. He added that the board could then keep a running list of potential nominations which could be carried over from year to year. The board agreed that would be a good idea.

C. 2015 Public Outreach & Tour - Planning

The board discussed potential destinations for the summer tour which typically occurs on the July meeting date. Planner Repya observed that with a proposed heritage landmark designation coming up for the Sara Moore house at 6909 Hillcrest Road, there has been interest in that

neighborhood - designed by Samuel Thorpe's company (of Country Club District fame) as part of the greater Southdale development. The board agreed that would be a great tour destination if not this year, before the designation, than next year after the public has learned about the neighborhood's unique beginnings.

Planner Repya pointed out to the board that scheduling the tour for the July meeting has always been somewhat tricky since the need to act on a potential COA application would require a cancellation of the tour. Member Sussman agreed, observing that the Edina Historical Society is interested in coordinating a tour of the Jewish cemetery on France Avenue with the HPB this summer; however they would need to commit to a specific date. The board agreed that it would be wise to schedule a special meeting for the summer tour and not risk scheduling it on a regular meeting date with the risk of it being cancelled. They also agreed to further pursue partnering with the Historical Society for the cemetery tour at an agreed upon date this summer. No formal action was taken.

VIII. CORRESPONDENCE & PETITIONS - None

IX. CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS - None

X. STAFF COMMENTS

Planner Repya explained that a proposed nomination study and plan of treatment was sent to Marri Oskam, owner of 6901 Dakota Trail. Ms. Oskam is now reviewing the document and will provide feedback regarding any additions or deletions she would like. Once she is satisfied, the procedures for Edina Heritage Landmark designation of her home will commence. Depending on timing, the HPB consideration of the new designation could commence at the next meeting in April. Ms. Repya reminded the board that in addition to the HPB approving to nominate the property, a comment period (60 days) is required from the State Historic Preservation Office; the Edina Planning Commission will review the proposal and provide a recommendation to the City Council who will finally hold a public hearing to add the Edina Heritage Landmark overlay zoning designation to the property.

The board agreed that they looked forward to proceeding with this first landmark designation of a private home since the Peterson House at 5312 Interlachen Boulevard was designated in 1986. No formal action was taken.

XI. NEXT MEETING DATE April 14, 2015

XII. ADJOURNMENT .

Member Birdman moved for adjournment at 8:45 p.m. Member Moore seconded the motion.
All voted aye. The motion carried.

Respectfully submitted,
Joyce Repya